

A solvable group
isospectral to $S_4(3)$

Andrei V. Zavarnitsine

Sobolev Institute of Mathematics
Novosibirsk

G is a finite group.

The set of element orders

$$\omega(G) = \{n \in \mathbb{N} \mid \exists g \in G : o(g) = n\},$$

called the **spectrum** of G , is uniquely determined by the set $\mu(G)$ of its maximal (under divisibility) elements.

The spectrum carries much information about the group.

Example: $\mu(G) = \{2, 3, 5\} \Rightarrow G \cong \text{Alt}_5$

What other finite simple groups have this property?

Groups G and H are isospectral if $\omega(G) = \omega(H)$.

Can a simple nonabelian group be isospectral to a solvable group?

G is a finite group.

The set of element orders

$$\omega(G) = \{n \in \mathbb{N} \mid \exists g \in G : o(g) = n\},$$

called the **spectrum** of G , is uniquely determined by the set $\mu(G)$ of its maximal (under divisibility) elements.

The spectrum carries much information about the group.

Example: $\mu(G) = \{2, 3, 5\} \Rightarrow G \cong \text{Alt}_5$

What other finite simple groups have this property?

Groups G and H are **isospectral** if $\omega(G) = \omega(H)$.

Can a simple nonabelian group be isospectral to a solvable group?

Theorem [M. S. Lucido, A. R. Moghaddamfar; 2004] If G is a nonabelian simple group isospectral to a solvable group then $G \cong L_3(3), U_3(3), S_4(3), \text{Alt}_{10}$.

Theorem [A. M. Staroletov; 2008] There exists no solvable group isospectral to Alt_{10} .

The existence of solvable groups isospectral to $L_3(3)$ and $U_3(3)$ was proven by V. D. Mazurov and M. R. Zinovieva.

The prime graph $\Gamma(G)$ of G :

Vertices: $\pi(G)$ (the prime divisors of $|G|$).

Edges: $p - q \iff pq \in \omega(G)$

- The knowledge of $\omega(G)$ allows one to construct $\Gamma(G)$.
- Isospectral groups have equal prime graphs.

Theorem [M. S. Lucido, A. R. Moghaddamfar; 2004] If G is a nonabelian simple group isospectral to a solvable group then $G \cong L_3(3), U_3(3), S_4(3), \text{Alt}_{10}$.

Theorem [A. M. Staroletov; 2008] There exists no solvable group isospectral to Alt_{10} .

The existence of solvable groups isospectral to $L_3(3)$ and $U_3(3)$ was proven by V. D. Mazurov and M. R. Zinovieva.

The **prime graph** $\Gamma(G)$ of G :

Vertices: $\pi(G)$ (the prime divisors of $|G|$).

Edges: $p - q \iff pq \in \omega(G)$

- The knowledge of $\omega(G)$ allows one to construct $\Gamma(G)$.
- Isospectral groups have equal prime graphs.

$s(G)$ is the number of connected components of $\Gamma(G)$.

- $s(G) \leq 6$ for all finite groups G .
- $s(G) = 6 \Rightarrow G \cong J_4$.

Groups G with $s(G) > 1$ have a very restricted structure.

Theorem [K. W. Gruenberg, O. Kegel; 1975] If G is a finite solvable group with $s(G) > 1$ then $s(G) = 2$ and one of the following conditions holds:

- $G = AB$ is a Frobenius group and the two components of $\Gamma(G)$ are the complete graphs on $\pi(A)$ and $\pi(B)$;
- $G = PAB$ is a doubly Frobenius group (i.e., P and PA are normal in G ; PA and AB are Frobenius groups) and the two components of $\Gamma(G)$ are the complete graphs on $\pi(PB)$ and $\pi(A)$.

$s(G)$ is the number of connected components of $\Gamma(G)$.

- $s(G) \leq 6$ for all finite groups G .
- $s(G) = 6 \Rightarrow G \cong J_4$.

Groups G with $s(G) > 1$ have a very restricted structure.

Theorem [K. W. Gruenberg, O. Kegel; 1975] If G is a finite solvable group with $s(G) > 1$ then $s(G) = 2$ and one of the following conditions holds:

- $G = AB$ is a Frobenius group and the two components of $\Gamma(G)$ are the complete graphs on $\pi(A)$ and $\pi(B)$;
- $G = PAB$ is a **doubly Frobenius group** (i.e., P and PA are normal in G ; PA and AB are Frobenius groups) and the two components of $\Gamma(G)$ are the complete graphs on $\pi(PB)$ and $\pi(A)$.

The prime graphs of $L_3(3)$ and $U_3(3)$ are disconnected:

$$\mu(L_3(3)) = \{6, 8, 13\}, \quad \Gamma(L_3(3)) : \begin{array}{c} 2 \\ \bullet \\ \vdots \\ \bullet \\ 3 \end{array} \bullet 13$$

$$\mu(U_3(3)) = \{7, 8, 12\}, \quad \Gamma(U_3(3)) : \begin{array}{c} 2 \\ \bullet \\ \vdots \\ \bullet \\ 3 \end{array} \bullet 7$$

In either case, there exists an isospectral Frobenius group:

$\mu(B) = \{6, 8\}$, where $B = 2.\text{Sym}_4 \leq \text{SL}_2(13^2)$ acts fixed-point freely on A of order 13^4 . Hence, $\mu(AB) = \{6, 8, 13\}$.

$\mu(B) = \{8, 12\}$, where $B = 3 : 8 \leq \text{GL}_2(7^2)$ acts fixed-point freely on A of order 7^4 . Hence, $\mu(AB) = \{7, 8, 12\}$.

The prime graphs of $L_3(3)$ and $U_3(3)$ are disconnected:

$$\mu(L_3(3)) = \{6, 8, 13\}, \quad \Gamma(L_3(3)) : \begin{array}{c} 2 \\ \vdots \\ 3 \end{array} \bullet 13$$

$$\mu(U_3(3)) = \{7, 8, 12\}, \quad \Gamma(U_3(3)) : \begin{array}{c} 2 \\ \vdots \\ 3 \end{array} \bullet 7$$

In either case, there exists an isospectral Frobenius group:

$\mu(B) = \{6, 8\}$, where $B = 2.\text{Sym}_4 \leq \text{SL}_2(13^2)$ acts fixed-point freely on A of order 13^4 . Hence, $\mu(AB) = \{6, 8, 13\}$.

$\mu(B) = \{8, 12\}$, where $B = 3 : 8 \leq \text{GL}_2(7^2)$ acts fixed-point freely on A of order 7^4 . Hence, $\mu(AB) = \{7, 8, 12\}$.

The case of $S_4(3)$ is more difficult.

$$\mu(S_4(3)) = \{5, 9, 12\}, \quad \Gamma(S_4(3)) : \begin{array}{c} 2 \\ \vdots \\ 3 \end{array} \bullet 5$$

There exists no Frobenius group AB isospectral to $S_4(3)$.

Indeed,

- if $\pi(A) = \{2, 3\}$ then $4, 9 \in \omega(A) \Rightarrow 36 \in \omega(A)$, since A is nilpotent;
- if $\pi(B) = \{2, 3\}$ then $2, 9 \in \omega(B) \Rightarrow 18 \in \omega(B)$, since B has a central involution.

Is there a doubly Frobenius group isospectral to $S_4(3)$?

The case of $S_4(3)$ is more difficult.

$$\mu(S_4(3)) = \{5, 9, 12\}, \quad \Gamma(S_4(3)) : \begin{array}{c} 2 \\ \vdots \\ 3 \end{array} \bullet 5$$

There exists no Frobenius group AB isospectral to $S_4(3)$.

Indeed,

- if $\pi(A) = \{2, 3\}$ then $4, 9 \in \omega(A) \Rightarrow 36 \in \omega(A)$, since A is nilpotent;
- if $\pi(B) = \{2, 3\}$ then $2, 9 \in \omega(B) \Rightarrow 18 \in \omega(B)$, since B has a central involution.

Is there a doubly Frobenius group isospectral to $S_4(3)$?

The case of $S_4(3)$ is more difficult.

$$\mu(S_4(3)) = \{5, 9, 12\}, \quad \Gamma(S_4(3)) : \begin{array}{c} 2 \\ \vdots \\ 3 \end{array} \cdot 5$$

There exists no Frobenius group AB isospectral to $S_4(3)$.

Indeed,

- if $\pi(A) = \{2, 3\}$ then $4, 9 \in \omega(A) \Rightarrow 36 \in \omega(A)$, since A is nilpotent;
- if $\pi(B) = \{2, 3\}$ then $2, 9 \in \omega(B) \Rightarrow 18 \in \omega(B)$, since B has a central involution.

Is there a doubly Frobenius group isospectral to $S_4(3)$?

If G is a doubly Frobenius group with $\mu(G) = \{5, 9, 12\}$ then $G = PAB$, where

- P should be a 3-group of exponent 9;
- AB should be Frobenius of the form $5 : 4$;
- A must act on P fixed-point freely;
- $C_P(b^2)$ must have exponent 3, where $B = \langle b \rangle$.

Construction:

The group $AB = \langle a, b \mid a^5 = b^4 = 1, a^b = a^2 \rangle$ has a unique faithful irreducible canonical representation in characteristic 3.

$$a \rightarrow \alpha = \begin{pmatrix} \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \\ -1 & -1 & -1 & -1 \end{pmatrix}, \quad b \rightarrow \beta = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot \\ -1 & -1 & -1 & -1 \\ \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \cdot \end{pmatrix}.$$

If G is a doubly Frobenius group with $\mu(G) = \{5, 9, 12\}$ then $G = PAB$, where

- P should be a 3-group of exponent 9;
- AB should be Frobenius of the form $5 : 4$;
- A must act on P fixed-point freely;
- $C_P(b^2)$ must have exponent 3, where $B = \langle b \rangle$.

Construction:

The group $AB = \langle a, b \mid a^5 = b^4 = 1, a^b = a^2 \rangle$ has a unique faithful irreducible **canonical** representation in characteristic 3.

$$a \rightarrow \alpha = \begin{pmatrix} \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \\ -1 & -1 & -1 & -1 \end{pmatrix}, \quad b \rightarrow \beta = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot \\ -1 & -1 & -1 & -1 \\ \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \cdot \end{pmatrix}.$$

If G is a doubly Frobenius group with $\mu(G) = \{5, 9, 12\}$ then $G = PAB$, where

- P should be a 3-group of exponent 9;
- AB should be Frobenius of the form $5 : 4$;
- A must act on P fixed-point freely;
- $C_P(b^2)$ must have exponent 3, where $B = \langle b \rangle$.

Construction:

The group $AB = \langle a, b \mid a^5 = b^4 = 1, a^b = a^2 \rangle$ has a unique faithful irreducible **canonical** representation in characteristic 3.

$$a \rightarrow \alpha = \begin{pmatrix} \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \\ -1 & -1 & -1 & -1 \end{pmatrix}, \quad b \rightarrow \beta = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot \\ -1 & -1 & -1 & -1 \\ \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \cdot \end{pmatrix}.$$

Three 16×16 -matrices over \mathbb{F}_3 in the block form:

$$a \rightarrow \text{diag}(\alpha, \alpha, \alpha, \alpha), \quad b \rightarrow \text{diag}(\beta, \beta, \beta, \beta),$$

$$c = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \beta & \beta^2 & \cdot \\ \cdot & 1 & \cdot & -\beta^2 \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \beta^3 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

The group $H = \langle a, b, c \rangle$ acts on the row space $V = (\mathbb{F}_3)^{16}$.

The semidirect product $G = V \rtimes H$ is the required doubly Frobenius group PAB , where $A = \langle a \rangle$, $B = \langle b \rangle$, and $P = V \rtimes \langle c \rangle^A$ is of nilpotency class 3.

Three 16×16 -matrices over \mathbb{F}_3 in the block form:

$$a \rightarrow \text{diag}(\alpha, \alpha, \alpha, \alpha), \quad b \rightarrow \text{diag}(\beta, \beta, \beta, \beta),$$

$$c = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \beta & \beta^2 & \cdot \\ \cdot & 1 & \cdot & -\beta^2 \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \beta^3 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

The group $H = \langle a, b, c \rangle$ acts on the row space $V = (\mathbb{F}_3)^{16}$.

The semidirect product $G = V \rtimes H$ is the required doubly Frobenius group PAB , where $A = \langle a \rangle$, $B = \langle b \rangle$, and $P = V \rtimes \langle c \rangle^A$ is of nilpotency class 3.

The group G constructed above can be represented by 17×17 -matrices over \mathbb{F}_3 . It has order

$$5\,648\,590\,729\,620 = 2^2 \cdot 3^{24} \cdot 5,$$

and is believed to be the smallest solvable group isospectral to $S_4(3)$.

Remark The proof that G is isospectral to $S_4(3)$ does not depend on computer calculations. However, the first evidence for the existence of this group was obtained with the aid of the computer algebra system GAP.

Theorem A finite simple nonabelian group G is isospectral to a solvable group if and only if $G \cong L_3(3), U_3(3), S_4(3)$.

The group G constructed above can be represented by 17×17 -matrices over \mathbb{F}_3 . It has order

$$5\,648\,590\,729\,620 = 2^2 \cdot 3^{24} \cdot 5,$$

and is believed to be the smallest solvable group isospectral to $S_4(3)$.

Remark The proof that G is isospectral to $S_4(3)$ does not depend on computer calculations. However, the first evidence for the existence of this group was obtained with the aid of the computer algebra system GAP.

Theorem A finite simple nonabelian group G is isospectral to a solvable group if and only if $G \cong L_3(3), U_3(3), S_4(3)$.

The group G constructed above can be represented by 17×17 -matrices over \mathbb{F}_3 . It has order

$$5\,648\,590\,729\,620 = 2^2 \cdot 3^{24} \cdot 5,$$

and is believed to be the smallest solvable group isospectral to $S_4(3)$.

Remark The proof that G is isospectral to $S_4(3)$ does not depend on computer calculations. However, the first evidence for the existence of this group was obtained with the aid of the computer algebra system GAP.

Theorem A finite simple nonabelian group G is isospectral to a solvable group if and only if $G \cong L_3(3), U_3(3), S_4(3)$.

Sketch of the proof:

17-dimensional representation of G in block form:

$$a \rightarrow \text{diag}(1, \alpha, \alpha, \alpha, \alpha), \quad b \rightarrow \text{diag}(1, \beta, \beta, \beta, \beta),$$

$$c \rightarrow \left(\begin{array}{c|cccc} 1 & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\ \hline \cdot & 1 & \beta & \beta^2 & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot & -\beta^2 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \beta^3 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \end{array} \right), \quad d = \left(\begin{array}{c|cccc} 1 & \delta & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\ \hline \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \end{array} \right),$$

where $\delta = (1, 0, 0, 0) \in (\mathbb{F}_3)^4$.

We have $G = \langle a, b, c, d \rangle$.

Step 1: P has exponent 9.

(Recall that $G = PAB$, and $P = O_3(G)$.)

Each element of P has the form

$$\left(\begin{array}{c|cccc} 1 & \delta_1 & \delta_2 & \delta_3 & \delta_4 \\ \hline \cdot & 1 & \mu_1 & \mu_3 & \nu \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \mu_4 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \mu_2 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \end{array} \right) \cdot$$

P is naturally embedded into the upper unitriangular 5×5 -matrix group over $M_4(\mathbb{F}_3)$.

Lemma Let

$$X = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \chi_1 & \eta_1 & \theta_1 & \tau_1 \\ \cdot & 1 & \chi_2 & \eta_2 & \theta_2 \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \chi_3 & \eta_3 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \chi_4 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

be an upper unitriangular 5×5 -matrix over a (not necessarily commutative) ring of characteristic 3. Then $X^9 = 1$ and $|X| < 9$ iff

$$\begin{aligned} \chi_1 \chi_2 \chi_3 &= 0, \\ \chi_2 \chi_3 \chi_4 &= 0, \\ \chi_1 \chi_2 \eta_3 + \chi_1 \eta_2 \chi_4 + \eta_1 \chi_3 \chi_4 &= 0. \end{aligned}$$

P has an element such that $\delta_1(\mu_1 \mu_4 + \mu_3 \mu_2) \neq 0$.

Step 2: A acts fixed-point freely on P .

We have $P = V \rtimes \langle c \rangle^A$.

$$V = (\mathbb{F}_3)^{16} = W \oplus W \oplus W \oplus W,$$

where W is the canonical module for $AB = 5 : 4$.

Due to the special choice of the matrix

$$c = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \beta & \beta^2 & \cdot \\ \cdot & 1 & \cdot & -\beta^2 \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \beta^3 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \end{pmatrix},$$

one shows that $\langle c \rangle^A = 3^4.3^4$ is of nilpotency class 2 with central factors isomorphic to W as \mathbb{F}_3AB -modules.

Step 3: $C_P(b^2)$ has exponent 3.

Every element of $C_P(b^2)$ has the form

$$\left(\begin{array}{c|cccc} 1 & \delta_1 & \delta_2 & \delta_3 & \delta_4 \\ \hline \cdot & 1 & \mu_1 & \mu_3 & \nu \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \cdot & \mu_4 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \mu_2 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \end{array} \right)$$

with $\delta_i \in C_W(b^2)$ and $\mu_i, \nu \in C_M(b^2)$, where

W is the canonical module for $AB = 5 : 4$, and

$M = M_4(\mathbb{F}_3)$ viewed as a module for AB with action by conjugation.

It can be shown that $C_P(b^2)$ has exponent 3 iff

$$w \psi(u) = 0 \quad (*)$$

for all $w, u \in C_W(b^2)$, where

$$\psi : C_W(b^2) \rightarrow M$$

is a certain quadratic map of $\mathbb{F}_3 B$ -modules.

Due to the special choice of the matrix

$$c = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \beta & \beta^2 & \cdot \\ \cdot & 1 & \cdot & -\beta^2 \\ \cdot & \cdot & 1 & \beta^3 \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & 1 \end{pmatrix},$$

the identity (*) can be shown to hold.

The paper “A solvable group isospectral to $S_4(3)$ ”

- is available on arXiv.org (*arXiv:0904.2829*),
- is to appear in *Siberian Mathematical Journal*.

Thank you

The paper “A solvable group isospectral to $S_4(3)$ ”

- is available on arXiv.org (*arXiv:0904.2829*),
- is to appear in *Siberian Mathematical Journal*.

Thank you