The Unseen Universe; Or, Physical Speculations on a Future State

P. G. Tait & Balfour Stewart (1875)



Elizabeth Lewis --- University of St Andrews --- efr4@st-andrews.ac.uk Mathematicians and their gods --- Rewley House --- Oxford --- 15-16 Sept. 2012¹

Introduction

scientific basis

Uniting C19th physical science with the established doctrines of Christianity

- Possibility of immortality
- Existence of an unseen universe
- Relationship between science and religion
- Position of the man of science

Principle of Continuity

The anonymity game

- 1st edition April 1875
- 3 editions published anonymously
- Authorship revealed April 1876

The Athenaeum's revelation:

'Dr. Balfour Stewart, of Manchester, and Mr. P.G. Tait, Professor of Natural Philosophy at the University of Edinburgh '[1]

Tait's Scrap-Book

The James Clerk Maxwell Foundation, Edinburgh http://www.clerkmaxwellfoundation.org

The anonymity game – cryptic revelation

'Thought conceived to affect the matter of another universe simultaneously with this may explain future state ' [2]

chose to give As Co D E12 F4 G He Is Lo No Os P R4 So TH These letters placed rightly compose a proposit

Nature October 1874

munication signed riority of date, a hose to give it at Vº WXY. ought conceived ith this may exion and expan-

The Nation, May 27, 1875 [2]

The authors

Peter Guthrie Tait (1831 - 1901)

Balfour Stewart (1828 - 1887)



The Unseen Universe Paradoxical Philosophy 3 papers: 'On the heating of a disk by rapid rotation in vacuo'



1847: Univ. of Ed.
1848: Peterhouse, Cambridge
1854: Prof. mathematics, Queen's, Belfast
1860-1901: Chair Natural philosophy, Ed.
1861: elected FRSE

1845: Univ. of Ed.
---training in merchantile profession---1856: Univ. Of Ed., Forbes' assistant
1859: Director of Kew Observatory
1862: elected FRS
1870-1887: Prof. physics, Owen's College,
Manchester

The Christian man of science

Nature and Scripture – the Two Books of Revelation

Open to criticism

'Some call us infidels, while others represent us as very much too orthodoxly credulous; some call us pantheists, some materialists, others spiritualists.' [3(i)]

Their challenge

Welcoming 'with sincere pleasure any remarks or criticism on these speculations ... whether by the leaders of scientific thought, or by those of religious inquiry' [3(ii)]

Venturing outside the boundaries of distinct areas of knowledge

The Christian man of science

Service through science

Created in His image:

encourages an honest inquiry into questions demanding both a theological and scientific approach

Scientific inquiry:

an inlet to Revelation



Intimate knowledge of Christian doctrine through Personal faith

Profound understanding of contemporary science

Thinking this way, the purpose of science might be all at once: the glory of God, the search for truth and the 'ennoblement of human beings'. [4]

The Christian man of science

Science and religion the nature of the relationship

'Foundational' and 'interactive' [5]

Not 'independent' [5]

'The truth is, that science and religion neither are nor can be two fields of knowledge with no possible communication between them. Such a hypothesis is simply absurd.'[3(ii)]

The Unseen Universe – a model of how to engage in the science v religion debate

Contribution – identify the real antagonists

Motivation – Tyndall's Belfast address

Presidential address

British Association for the Advancement of Science August 1874

- 'superior authority of science over religious and non-rationalistic explanations' [6];
- the freedom of scientific inquiry from religious authority;
- and an end to religious intrusion into the domain of science.



John Tyndall (1820-1893)

--MATERIALISM--

Motivation – Tyndall's Belfast address

- A source of irritation
- Correspondences regarding themes

Knott (Tait's biographer):

'In the winter of 1874, a few months after the delivery by Tyndall of his famous presidential address before the British Association at Belfast, it began to be whispered among the students of Edinburgh University that Tait was engaged on a book which was to overthrow materialism by a purely scientific argument. When, in the succeeding spring, *The Unseen Universe* appeared it was at once accepted as the fulfilment of this rumour.' [7]

Unseen Universe anticipated in Tait and Stewart's earlier work

The Principle of Continuity

Appeal to the critics – a dual definition

Spirit of science – uniformity of law

' The government of the universe has proceeded on a certain path, ruled by certain fixed laws, we may therefore infer that it will continue to be so ' [8]

Spirit of religion – expression of trust

' God has endowed us with certain capacities which enable us to dwell safely in the world and serve Him according to His laws. He will not distress or alarm His children by capriciously suspending or setting aside the laws which guide His universe.' [8]

Uniting the two

the uniformity of natural law as the 'steady expression of the unchanging Will of the Creator' [9]

The Principle of Continuity

An intellectual process

'the Principle of Continuity ... has solely reference to the intellectual faculties' [10]

'a foregoing condition of things capable of producing that which is' [11]

'continuous chain of cause and effect, of antecedent and consequent' [9]

The Principle of Continuity

A breach of continuity

'Continuity, in fine, does not preclude the occurrence of strange, abrupt, unforeseen events in the history of the universe, but only of such events as must finally and for ever put to confusion the intelligent beings who regard them.' [3(iii)]

The Great First Cause and the origin of life

- The Great First Cause 'absolutely self evident the existence of a Deity, who is the Creator of all things' [3(iv)]
- Intelligent design

(i) sporadic/abrupt beginning (ii) atoms as manufactured articles

• Life development

Evolutionary creationist, accommodating Christianity and Darwinism Darwin's primordial germ – living antecedent required 3rd person of the Trinity – the Lord and Giver of Life

(2nd person of the Trinity – developer of energy of the universe)

• Duty of the man of science

'to put back the direct interference of the Great First Cause' [3(v)]

Abiogenesis: the hypothesis that living matter may be produced from non-living matter. The term was first used by Huxley in 1870.

The end of the visible universe

Scripture and science both point to the same catastrophe—the end of the visible universe—'the one in language a child can understand, the other in the wordless eloquence of Nature's changeless laws'[8], therefore, the present visible universe is no home for the immortal soul.

- Aggregation of masses, degradation and dissipation of energy
- Heat death

Finite size of observable masses - > Universe had its origins in time

The existence of an unseen universe

If only the visible universe exists - it's beginning and end are breaks of continuity

Interaction between universes

- Visible evolved in matter and energy from the unseen and will retire into it
- Independent but intimately connected
- Exchanges of energy with the ether as a bridge

Conclusion

'visible is not the whole universe, but only, it may be, a very small part of it' [3(vi)]

Thomson's vortex atom theory The latest speculation on the theory of matter



William Thomson (1824 - 1907)

Universe's primordial atoms

Vortices developed from a pre-existing fluid filling all space

Perfect fluid -> creative act in time (breach of continuity)

Less than perfect fluid -> nonpermanence of the visible order of things

A unique form of vortex ring for each of the elements?

The Great Whole – an infinite number of universes

Led by the Principle of Continuity

Mother Universe

One universe of infinite energy with an intelligent developing agent of infinite energy

Great whole – infinite in energy, everlasting

Appreciation of fine-tuning

(i) development of complexity from that which is simple (ii) delicate balance of unstable forces



Elizabeth Lewis --- University of St Andrews --- efr4@st-andrews.ac.uk

Immortality and a spiritual body

Sources in favour of immortality

(i) Statements about Christ (ii) man's intense longing for immortality

Nature of a future state

View grounded in Scriptural revelation

Immortality as a transference

'From the visible universe to some other order of things intimately connected with it' [3(viii)]

Spiritual body

Frame for each individual receiving molecular displacements of the brain



Conditions of

intelligent existence

The authors' hypotheses - summary

Reason to believe in...

- a Creator;
- the creation of the visible universe in time;
- the end of the visible universe in time;
- the existence of an unseen universe;
- an infinite series of invisible universes
- one invisible universe of infinite energy in which an intelligent agency (of infinite energy) resides;
- the Great Whole—infinite in energy and eternal;
- a spiritual body connecting us with the unseen;
- personal immortality;
- and roles for the 2nd and 3rd persons of the Trinity as developers of energy and life in the universe.

Reception

Close scrutiny

Appeal

Authors' 'real and intimate' knowledge of the latest scientific theories [9]

Sequel

Paradoxical Philosophy (1878)

Reasoning

- Discipline of philosophy
- Legitimate scientific inference
- Communication
- Religious licence

Robust counter-attack

Reception

Praise

An honest search for the truth 'Deep intuitions of the spirit as well as ... the logical faculties of the brain' [12] 'Clear expositions of scientific truth' [13] Applications of sound scientific reasoning Hope for truth in major propositions

Truth in their propositions

String theory and M-theory anticipated

A theory of everything

Thomson's vortex atom -> string theory

Conception of the multiverse -> M[embrane] theory

Summary

A Trinity of mysteries

'... the position of the scientific man is to clear a space before him from which all mystery shall be driven away, and in which there shall be nothing but matter and certain laws which he can comprehend. There are however three great mysteries (a trinity of mysteries) which elude, and will for ever elude his grasp ... they are the mystery of matter and energy; the mystery of life; and the mystery of God,— and these three are one.' [3(ix)]

References

- [1] The Spiritualist Newspaper, May 28, 1875 *
- [2] The Nation, May 27, 1875 *
- [3] Stewart, B, & Tait, P G, The unseen universe: or, physical speculations on a future state, 2nd ed., London: Macmillan and Co., 1875, pgs.: (i) v (ii) 210 (iii) 60 (iv) 47 (v) 131-132 (vi) 157 (vii) 171 (viii) 66-67 (ix) 236-237
- [4] Ratzsch, D, 'The nature of science', Science and religion in dialogue, edited by Melville Y. Stewart, Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, (2009), 41–53; online ed., [http://www.dawsonera.com/depp/reader/protected/external/AbstractView/S9781444317367] accessed 8 August 2012, pg. 50
- [5] Haarsma, D B, 'Science and religion in harmony', Science and religion in dialogue, edited by Melville Y. Stewart, Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, (2009), 107–119; online ed., [http://www.dawsonera.com/depp/reader/protected/external/AbstractView/S9781444317367] accessed 8 August 2012, pg. 105
- [6] Van Wyhe, John, 'John Tyndall (1820–1893)', Victorian Web, (2002) [http://www.victorianweb.org/science/tyndall.htm] accessed 8 August 2012.
- [7] Knott, C G, Life and Scientific Work of Peter Guthrie Tait, Cambridge University Press, 1911, pg. 236

References

[8] The Monthly Packet, no date *
[9] The Guardian, June 23, 1875 *
[10] Preface to the 4th Edition, no date, pg. vi *
[11] Science Sermons for Young People, no date, pg. 110 *
[12] The Truthseeker, Jan, 1876 *
[13] The Globe, April 30, no year *

* Sourced from Tait's Scrap-book in Edinburgh (preserved by the Maxwell Foundation).